

BEFORE THE ARKANSAS DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION  
STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION  
#4 Capitol Mall  
Little Rock, AR

March 18, 2016  
4:15 P.M.

APPEARANCES:

Mr. Johnny Key	Commissioner
Ms. Toyce Newton	Chairperson
Ms. Ouida Newton	Teacher of the Year/ Non-Voting Member

APPEARANCES (via telephone):

Ms. Mireya Reith	Vice Chairman
Ms. Vicki Saviers	Board Member
Mr. Joseph Black	Board Member
Dr. Jay Barth	Board Member
Ms. Diane Zook	Board Member
Ms. Susan Chambers	Board Member
Ms. Charisse Dean	Board Member
Mr. R. Brett Williamson	Board Member

LEGAL COUNSEL FOR THE BOARD:

MS. KENDRA CLAY	ADE General Counsel
-----------------	---------------------

**ORIGINAL**

TIFFANIE N. HARRISON, CCR  
(501) 960-2219

**I N D E X**

	Page
APPEARANCES . . . . .	1
PROCEEDINGS . . . . .	3
A-1: Discussion of Additional information Needed for March 31, 2016 Review of Charter Schools	
PROCEEDINGS CONCLUDED . . . . .	29
COURT REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE. . . . .	30

**E X H I B I T S**

**None marked.**

**P R O C E E D I N G S**

1  
2 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: So, at this time, the meeting is  
3 officially called to order. I would ask that everyone please  
4 silence their electronic devices. This is a special meeting so  
5 I will start first by calling roll of present Board members.  
6 Susan Chambers?

7 MS. CHAMBERS: Here.

8 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Joe Black?

9 MR. BLACK: Yes.

10 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Brett Williamson?

11 MR. WILLIAMSON: I'm here.

12 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Vicki Saviers?

13 MS. SAVIERS: Present.

14 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Mireya Reith?

15 MS. REITH: Here.

16 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Diane Zook?

17 MS. ZOOK: Yes.

18 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Jay Barth?

19 DR. BARTH: I'm here.

20 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: And Charisse Dean?

21 MS. DEAN: Yes, I'm here.

22 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Okay. So, all members are present via  
23 conference call. I'm going to ask Ms. Clay to come and give us  
24 some introduction about the purpose of the meeting.

25 MS. ZOOK: Toyce, I'm having trouble hearing you. Can

1 they get the microphone closer to you?

2 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: I can't get it any closer. I'm speaking  
3 -- I don't know if maybe it's your receiver, or your ear phone,  
4 or something, but it's as close as it can get.

5 MS. ZOOK: Okay. Thank you. I'll strain.

6 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Okay. Ms. Clay?

7 MS. CLAY: Good afternoon. I'm Kendra Clay, general  
8 counsel for the Department of Education. On your agenda today  
9 is just one item, and that is discussion of any additional  
10 information that the State Board may require from the four  
11 charter schools that will be reviewed at a later date, or the  
12 Department, or affected school districts. So, those are the  
13 entities that you all can request additional information from.

14 Just a little background, at your March 10, 2016 Board  
15 meeting, you exercised your authority under Arkansas Code  
16 Annotated § 6-23-703(a), and voted to review the determinations  
17 made by the ADE Charter Authorizing Panel, regarding four  
18 charter schools. During the discussion on March 10th, you did  
19 not discuss what, if any, additional information you require  
20 from ADE, public charter schools, or affected school districts.

21 Pursuant to Arkansas Code Annotated § 6-23-703(b)(1), if  
22 you vote to review final decisions made by the Charter  
23 Authorizing Panel, you are required to state the specific  
24 additional information you require from the Department, charter  
25 schools, or affected school districts.

1           In order to comply with the law's requirement that the  
2 State Board state the specific additional information  
3 requested, a public meeting had to be held. That's why we're  
4 here today. I understand that on most agenda items the State  
5 Board sees an individual board member has a question, or needs  
6 additional information, that request is made informally,  
7 through ADE staff. The difference between those and formal  
8 requests made by individual board members, and today's matter  
9 that is before you, is that the law outlines the process to  
10 request additional information from certain entities, in the  
11 context of when the State Board decides to review a charter  
12 panel decision.

13           The only way for you, as a State Board, to request the  
14 additional information as required by the law, it to do so  
15 publically in an open meeting. I'll be happy to answer any  
16 questions you have, otherwise I'll yield to the Board's  
17 discussion of any additional information requested from  
18 Covenant Keepers, E-Stem, Imboden Area Charter School, or LISA  
19 Academy. You will not need to take any action today. The  
20 meeting would just be for discussion purposes.

21           Madame Chair, there have been a few individuals that  
22 signed up for public comment. I believe, at last check there  
23 were seven. In order to allow the public comment, you would  
24 need to vote, as a Board, and a majority vote would allow  
25 public comment. I will remind you that the public meeting for

1 three of the four charter schools that are going to be  
2 reviewed, will be held on March 31<sup>st</sup> at 5 PM, and the public  
3 will have an opportunity, at that time, to comment. And the  
4 Imboden Area Charter School will be held at the April meeting  
5 at the State Board, and the public will also be allowed to  
6 comment, at that time. Do you, or any of the board members  
7 have questions?

8 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Okay. That's where we'll start. You've  
9 heard -- has everyone had the opportunity, and with clarity, to  
10 hear Ms. Clay's comment about the reflections on what the law  
11 requires and the guidelines, of which we're going to follow in  
12 this meeting? So, are there any questions of her, at this  
13 point, about the procedural process that we'll follow?

14 (NO RESPONSE FROM BOARD MEMBERS.)

15 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: If not, we will start with Ms. Chambers.  
16 And we'll ask individually, the Board members, if they have  
17 questions. Ms. Clay do you want to stay, because they'll  
18 initially direct these questions to you and we'll go from  
19 there. So, Ms. Chambers?

20 MS. CHAMBERS: I'm sorry, Madame Chair. I think we're all  
21 on a -- what we're hearing is not directly in front of you. Is  
22 what's directed to me, is this an opportunity for me to ask  
23 questions?

24 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: If you have any questions, this is your  
25 opportunity to ask questions.

1 MS. CHAMBERS: About the process, or what additional  
2 information that I need?

3 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Any additional information that you need,  
4 or about the process. I think the process was laid out fairly  
5 plainly by Ms. Clay, but if you have any additional information  
6 that you need, relative to the decision to review these  
7 charters, I think this is the time.

8 MS. CHAMBERS: Thank you. I do have a question and I'm not  
9 sure who to direct it to. One of the things that I think all  
10 of my fellow Board members will get a benefit from is a  
11 continuing stream of communications that's been quite measured  
12 from districts of proponents or critics, that they had to come  
13 from either pro-charter, or pro traditional public school. And  
14 one of the things that I am in need of, and I think would be  
15 helpful next week in our meeting, is information that would  
16 attempt to bridge the two.

17 Most of the communication that we've received so far, in  
18 the form of email, tends to indicate that the existence of a  
19 charter school or a traditional public school is at the expense  
20 of the demise of the other. I don't see a lot of -- I have yet  
21 to see a lot of stats that would help us understand what the  
22 trade-offs are between the traditional public -- Little Rock,  
23 traditional public schools and what income they would lose, if  
24 the charter were expended. So, I would like information about  
25 what the cost of the charter is to the traditional school.

1 That would be one question, and again, I'm not sure who to pose  
2 that to.

3 I would like to suggest that specifics that are shared  
4 about the demographic of the existing charter -- and I'm making  
5 my comment specifically to E-Stem and LISA Academy. What are  
6 the demographics of the existing school, and what would be the  
7 anticipated demographics of the expansion, and if that  
8 information is valid?

9 And the third would be, the assumption has been made in a  
10 few cases about preening the public schools, in terms of the  
11 students that are - that have applied or transitioned in the  
12 charter school. My theory is next week both sides will present  
13 their specific case, and the presentations will not necessarily  
14 provide the bridging application. It helps if we make sure  
15 that we have, not just half in connection with the two  
16 entities. Does that set of questions -- Madame Chair I'm not  
17 sure if that should be directed to you or to Kendra.

18 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: I think, probably, to the staff more than  
19 to Kendra, specifically, because I think probably staff may be  
20 able to pull that information out of the information that was  
21 presented at the Charter Screening Committee to the Charter  
22 Screening Committee. So, I think the information is likely  
23 there. If it's not, then, that sort of send -- likely a staff  
24 member, and I think Ms. Coffman, maybe you can direct getting  
25 the correct inquiry to the correct individual to satisfy Mrs.

1 Chambers's questions. She's nodding in agreement, so I think  
2 we can provide it, but I don't think it would be Ms. Clay's job  
3 to do it.

4 MS. CLAY: No, we -- charter staff and Ms. Coffman are  
5 taking notes, and we'll either direct where that information  
6 can be found in the documents already submitted, or direct to  
7 the proper entity, either the school district, or the charter  
8 school to answer that.

9 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Does that end your inquiries Ms.  
10 Chambers?

11 CHAMBERS: It does. Thank you. I think it's beneficial to  
12 make sure all of the Board members have that information, but I  
13 think it's also important that as many people as are  
14 participating with their opinions publicly, I just want to make  
15 sure that information is available to them. as well. I presume  
16 that it is, or will be.

17 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Okay. Thank you. Mr. Black any  
18 inquiries at this hearing.

19 MR. BLACK: What did you say?

20 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Are there any -- do you have any  
21 questions for clarification, prior to our March 31st meeting?

22 MR. BLACK: No, I do not.

23 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Okay. Thank you. Mr. Williamson.

24 MR. WILLIAMSON: Madame Chair, I have enough information  
25 from the Authorizing Panel. I don't need anything additional.

1 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Okay. Ms. Saviers?

2 MS. SAVIERS: Yes. I expressed this to Ms. Clay,  
3 previously, but I'm wondering if we could have the link to the  
4 Charter Panel video for the four charter schools that we will  
5 be reviewing.

6 MS. CLAY: Yes ma'am. This is Kendra Clay. We will send  
7 the links out. We can do that today, so that you all can be  
8 reviewing that.

9 MS. SAVIERS: Thank you.

10 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Is that it, Ms. Saviers?

11 MS. SAVIERS: That's it.

12 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Okay. Ms. Reith?

13 MS. REITH: Thank you, Madame Chair. I guess I'm going to  
14 elaborate on the comments made by Ms. Chambers. I guess I  
15 would see my request for information directed in one part to  
16 specifically the E-Stem and LISA charters, and then the other  
17 to the Little Rock School District. For the E-Stem and the  
18 LISA charters, I would just elaborate on Ms. Chambers's  
19 comments about current demographic.

20 I would be interested in a demographic outlook that  
21 reflected the last five years of students, including this year,  
22 and in addition to race, I would also want to specifically know  
23 any information related to free and reduced lunch, number of  
24 free and reduced lunch students, English language learners and  
25 special ed students.

1           And then I would need a -- I have a slight twist to the  
2 request of Ms. Chambers about anticipated population of  
3 students who would want to try and fill these additional seats  
4 and ask for any demographic information. So, that same  
5 demographic information, the race, free reduced lunch, English  
6 language learners and special ed, for the waiting list, because  
7 I'm assuming those would be some of the first individuals  
8 drawn. And if there is any information about the length of  
9 time that any of those individuals have been on the waiting  
10 list.

11           What I would add, as well, is any information in regard to  
12 discipline taken against their students, the discipline data or  
13 tracking, or the system that they use around discipline. And  
14 then, I would also be interested in their attrition rates. So,  
15 how many students that start at LISA actually complete and  
16 their tenure of opportunity there.

17           And I would finally be interested in a cost for the pupil  
18 analysis, that combines both public and private funds for those  
19 students, and then how that compares to the Little Rock School  
20 District.

21           CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Okay. Does that conclude your questions?

22           MS. REITH: Just a couple last questions for the Little  
23 Rock School District. So, those were for the charters. And,  
24 as for the Little Rock School District, any demographic  
25 information they have about the students who left their

1 district, also in the last five-year period. So, prior to  
2 graduation and going on to, we're assuming, one of these other  
3 alternatives of which charters are one. Then the seat  
4 availability of the Little Rock school, where these proposed  
5 expansion sites are being proposed. And that concludes my  
6 additional information request.

7 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: The last question about the seating  
8 availability. What was that?

9 MS. REITH: The Little Rock School District -- so where the  
10 expansion sites are anticipated to be located, so that the seat  
11 availability of the Little Rock schools which those students  
12 would have been filled.

13 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Okay. Does that conclude your questions,  
14 Ms. Reith?

15 MS. REITH: Yes, ma'am, Chair.

16 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Okay. Thank you. Ms. Zook?

17 MS. ZOOK: Yes, in addition to the questions that the two  
18 of my other Board members had, I would like -- I think most of  
19 this was covered by the LISA and E-Stem presentations to the  
20 Charter Panel. But what I lack from the Little Rock School  
21 District is their teacher absentee rate by school, their RGI  
22 plan that has been implemented at each school, their after  
23 school and extended year program available at school, if  
24 there's Lexia progress at each school, how many students have  
25 been referred to the ALE program in school -- ALE, as well as

1 through the ALE that has it's own LEA number for 13-14, 14-15,  
2 and 15-16, the students who have returned to the Little Rock  
3 School District from private or home school, the graduation  
4 rate for 13-14, and 14-15. And then in addition, I'd like the  
5 racial percentage and free and reduced rate for each school in  
6 the school district, and the area of -- and whether or not the  
7 school is a magnet school.

8 And that concludes my specific requests, other than next  
9 week is spring break. In order not to burden the people who  
10 are, sort of, the innocent in all of this, whether it be at the  
11 charters or the Little Rock School District, I think it would  
12 be considerate of others if we didn't have to have them have  
13 that information to us until the 29th, which would give them a  
14 couple of days after spring break. I think that may require a  
15 vote of the Board, but I think that's only right not to burden  
16 them with data collection that may not be right at their  
17 fingertips.

18 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Did you have a question, Ms. Clay.

19 MS. CLAY: I was just going to offer comment on the 29th,  
20 the date of the 29th. That is actually going to be the  
21 deadline date that was already talked about being established.  
22 That would not require a vote of the Board.

23 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Okay. Does that finish your questions,  
24 Ms. Zook?

25 MS. ZOOK: Yes, ma'am. And before we adjourn, I have

1 another matter I would like to bring before the Board. It's my  
2 understanding from legal that it would require a two thirds  
3 vote by the Board in order to consider it.

4 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Okay. So, I'll come back to you after I  
5 finish the questions.

6 MS. ZOOK: Okay. Thank you very much.

7 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: You're welcome. Dr. Barth?

8 DR. BARTH: Yes, thank you. My first question is to kind  
9 of understand an area that may have already been addressed, but  
10 my first question relates to E-Stem and LISA, and whether it is  
11 possible to get information on the size of the current waiting  
12 lists at the schools, at each school, how often the list is the  
13 purged, and corrected for any folks who may no longer be truly  
14 waiting, and/or reasons for how to make determinations on  
15 purging, if that does take place. If possible, information on  
16 whether there are implications of the students on the waiting  
17 list, if they're actually on waiting lists at multiple schools,  
18 and really anything that will provide insight into how many  
19 folks from (inaudible) see these schools as an option.

20 I also have questions about the demography of students on  
21 the list. But, again Ms. Reith covered that. The second area  
22 relates to information on the former students from the four  
23 charters. So, this would apply to all. That is, what do we  
24 know about which students are retained by the schools, where  
25 the students who are not retained go after leaving the charter,

1 and what we know about the demographics and achievement levels  
2 of those students who leave and how they compare with those who  
3 are retained. And I know some of that may not be possible, but  
4 whatever information we can get about the demography, as well  
5 as the achievement level of students who stay and those who  
6 leave.

7 And then, finally to pick up on Ms. Chambers's initial  
8 question, in addition to information about any loss of funds to  
9 the LRSD from the two charter expansion proposals, I would have  
10 interest in the LRSD take on a point of action to deal with the  
11 loss of funding, including the possibility of collaboration,  
12 between all existing charters in the southern -- south of the  
13 river, and the LRSD.

14 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Okay. So, Dr. Barth, does this finish  
15 your questions, completely, up until this point.

16 DR. BARTH: Excuse me. I couldn't hear you.

17 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Are you finished?

18 DR. BARTH: I am. Thank you.

19 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Okay. Thank you. Charisse Dean?

20 MS. DEAN: I believe both of my questions were addressed  
21 in previous questions. I just hand one little thing, for I  
22 think it was E-Stem. I'm curious about the high school that  
23 will be on the UALR campus. I'm curious about the division of  
24 the grades, the security, and the parking that will be  
25 available as far as parking for students for 11th and 12th

1 grade, and how will they navigate for the drop-off and things  
2 of that sort. That would conclude my questions.

3 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Okay. Thank you. Any follow-up  
4 questions relative to what we've talked about so far?

5 (NO RESPONSE FROM BOARD MEMBERS.)

6 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Okay. From what I understand, Ms. Clay,  
7 you can clear me up if I'm not correct, at this point we have a  
8 matter yet to be determined by Ms. Zook, and also we have the  
9 individuals that have signed up for public comment. And as I  
10 understand the rules, it has to be -- I don't know what Ms.  
11 Zook's question is, but relative to her question, when she asks  
12 it, there will then be opportunity for folks to speak. There  
13 will have to be a motion, a second, and two thirds vote by the  
14 Board; is that correct? To go any further than what we've  
15 listed on the agenda, so far.

16 MS. CLAY: Okay. I think there are two separate questions,  
17 there. One is whether to allow public comment on the agenda  
18 item that is in process now, which is the discussion of  
19 additional information. That would require a majority vote, to  
20 allow public comment. If Ms. Zook's question is to add an  
21 additional agenda item to the agenda, then that would take a  
22 two thirds vote, in order to get that item on today's agenda.

23 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Okay. And I think we're start with Ms.  
24 Zook. Your question, Ms. Zook.

25 MS. ZOOK: Yes. I was wondering -- I have done a lot of

1 study and visiting with the people from Imboden, and I would  
2 like for that to come to a vote on whether or not we are still  
3 wanting to review them. I don't know about others, if you'd  
4 had time to study it, but I -- after I studied and visited with  
5 the people involved in that school, then I no longer have any  
6 reservations about it, and have no need to review it.

7 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Is there any comment by Board members,  
8 starting with Mr. Chambers?

9 MS. CHAMBERS: No, not at this time.

10 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Ms. Black?

11 MR. BLACK: No questions.

12 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Mr. Williamson?

13 MR. WILLIAMSON: No questions. I agree with Ms. Zook.

14 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Ms. Saviers?

15 MS. SAVIERS: No questions.

16 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Ms. Reith?

17 MS. REITH: No questions.

18 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Dr. Barth?

19 DR. BARTH: No more questions, but I will continue to have  
20 some concerns about the sustainability, especially the long-  
21 term, but no more questions.

22 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: So, is your -- Ms. Williamson said she  
23 agreed with Ms. Zook, then that would lead me to conclude that  
24 you would like for it to be the April review, or do you want to  
25 discuss that before we -- a possible motion, Ms. Clay?

1 MS. CLAY: I would recommend, if there's a motion to add  
2 the item to the agenda, addressing that first, and then, there  
3 can be discussion on any possible motion on the added agenda  
4 item, should that item be added.

5 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Ms. Dean, do you have anything to add?

6 MS. ZOOK: No, other than, since it is a charter - to  
7 address Dr. Barth's point.

8 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Ms. Zook?

9 MS. ZOOK: This is a -- they can call down there, at any  
10 time. Whether its been like a year, two years, or three -- I  
11 think three with the zone Charter Panel, but because we can do  
12 that, I think that I feel comfortable moving that we add this  
13 to the agenda today.

14 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Okay. The question was to Ms. Dean. Did  
15 she have any further questions. Ms. Dean, do you have any  
16 further questions.

17 MS. ZOOK: I'm sorry. I apologize.

18 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: No problem. Ms. Dean, do you have any  
19 questions?

20 MS. DEAN: I do not, thank you.

21 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Okay. Then, the consideration is --  
22 well, we don't have a motion, so what is the pleasure of the  
23 Board regarding this matter with Imobden Charter School?

24 MS. ZOOK: Shall I make the motion again?

25 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: You didn't move the first time.

1 MS. ZOOK: Well I'll move now, that we add this to the  
2 agenda today to vote on.

3 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: We're not voting today. As I understand  
4 it, you're adding it to the agenda to be reviewed on.

5 MS. CLAY: I believe the proper motion would be adding to  
6 the agenda a consideration of rescission of the Charter Panel's  
7 decision -- or the State Board's decision to review the Charter  
8 Panel agenda.

9 MS. ZOOK: Okay. So moved.

10 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Okay. There's a motion by Ms. Zook. Is  
11 there a second?

12 MR. WILLIAMSON: Second by Brett.

13 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Okay. Second by Mr. Williamson. We're  
14 going to do a roll call for those in favor of Ms. Zook's  
15 motion. Ms. Chambers?

16 MS. CHAMBERS: Yes.

17 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Mr. Black?

18 MR. BLACK: Yes.

19 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Mr. Williamson?

20 MR. WILLIAMSON: Yes.

21 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Ms. Saviers?

22 MS. SAVIERS: Yes.

23 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Ms. Reith?

24 MS. REITH: No.

25 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Dr. Barth?

1 DR. BARTH: No.

2 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Ms. Zook?

3 MS. ZOOK: Yes.

4 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Ms. Dean?

5 MS. DEAN: Yes.

6 COMMISSIONER KEY: Six votes in the affirmative, two votes  
7 in the negative.

8 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: And the motion passes. Would you  
9 articulate the motion again for clarification?

10 MS. CLAY: Yes. I did a poor job the first time. This  
11 would be -- the motion, and now the agenda item, is  
12 consideration of the rescission of the State Board's decision  
13 to review the Charter Authorizing Panel's decision regarding  
14 Imboden Charter School.

15 MS. ZOOK: So moved.

16 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: She's just repeating for clarification.

17 MS. CLAY: I'm just repeating now what the agenda item is  
18 before you.

19 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: So, what's the next step?

20 MS. CLAY: The next step would be discussion of the agenda  
21 item that has been added, and then a motion, at the proper  
22 time, if someone so chooses.

23 MS. ZOOK: May I go first? This is Diane.

24 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Sure.

25 MS. ZOOK: Okay. After talking with the district and the

1 people who are aware of the program and the people who have  
2 attended the program. They consistently have a hundred percent  
3 parent participation at the parent-teacher conferences. They  
4 fund transportation to the district. They fund children from  
5 different districts. Thirty-eight percent of the children  
6 receive special ed services. I think, primarily, all of those  
7 are children who have learning disabilities. There's one who  
8 is mentally challenged.

9 It's a hundred percent Title I school. The state homeless  
10 rate is two percent, and theirs is 13 percent. They have  
11 children who not only access to running water and they're an  
12 active school. They serve breakfast and lunch to all of their  
13 students every day, and they have no audit findings to this  
14 point, and they provide counselors and tutors for the children  
15 and even for the smaller school, they do have counselors and  
16 tutors, which at a much smaller rate for counselors and the  
17 others.

18 So, for all those reasons, I see no need to ask them to  
19 come and present their information further.

20 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Any other comments?

21 DR. BARTH: This is Jay. As I said at the meeting last  
22 week, and again today, I think I am likely to support this  
23 charter's extension. I just do have those continuing questions  
24 about the -- about the sustainability, because it's a very  
25 small size of a school, and my concern today is that I think we

1 need to be very careful about adding agenda items to a call,  
2 mainly because we truly do not know if someone in the public,  
3 or otherwise, might have an interest in the agenda topic, and  
4 it was not listed on the agenda this afternoon. So, that would  
5 be my additional concern.

6 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Any other concerns or comments?

7 MS. SAVIERS: I feel like I voted incorrectly, when I said  
8 "Yes", because I have the same exact feelings that David  
9 described. I feel like I didn't have -- I certainly didn't  
10 anticipate the district coming, and didn't feel comfortable,  
11 because I haven't had a chance, myself, to review the material.  
12 So, it's not that -- I agree with Jay, and I feel like I would  
13 support it, and it seems like they're doing great work. And I  
14 appreciate the research that Ms. Zook has done, but it really  
15 -- I don't feel confident to make a decision today, and I think  
16 it would run down a slippery slope, adding agenda items. So,  
17 anyway, I was just really agreeing with what Jay just said.

18 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Okay. Any other comments or questions?

19 MS. CHAMBERS: Madame Chair, this is Susan Chambers. I  
20 have the exact the same feelings. So often times, unless we  
21 actually get an item to the table so that we can talk about it,  
22 it's not clear what our feelings are, and what we're thinking  
23 about it. So, I think this discussion is appropriate for the  
24 Board, and for the public to be able to understand where the  
25 Board is.

1 I think every time we are well intentioned, and we  
2 accelerate something, and put it on the agenda, or we don't go  
3 about it in a way that is what people expect, it causes  
4 conclusions in many cases that aren't correct. And it creates,  
5 I think, a potential breach of trust that the public  
6 understanding what we're doing and when and why. And so, my  
7 reply, I think it's appropriate for us to talk about it, and  
8 add it on the agenda for this conversation, but I'm not  
9 comfortable doing anything out of order with what we would  
10 normally do, and the approach we would have taken in the proper  
11 way.

12 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Any other comments?

13 (NO RESPONSE FROM BOARD MEMBERS)

14 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Is there a motion whether to change the  
15 review date?

16 MS. DEAN: I'm sorry. This is a Charisse Dean. I'm sorry.  
17 I agree with what Ms. Chambers said, and what Ms. Saviers, as  
18 well. I don't feel comfortable with adding agenda items on  
19 the fly. I think it would breed a sense of mistrust in the  
20 community and it does not allow the opportunity to prepare for  
21 these items that are added. So, I just want to echo that, as  
22 well. I'm sorry, I muted my phone.

23 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: So, are there any other questions?

24 (NO RESPONSE FROM BOARD MEMBERS.)

25 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: So, the matter before us is to -- I

1 think, one of two things. Leave the Imboden Charter review for  
2 the April Board meeting, or change to have that action on  
3 today; is that correct, Commissioner?

4 COMMISSIONER KEY: To rescind the decision.

5 MS. ZOOK: I apologize to my fellow Board members. I  
6 thought this was on the agenda a week ago, and until this  
7 morning, it was on today's agenda. I didn't realize that none  
8 of them had taken the time to look at it. So, I did not intend  
9 to catch you blind sighted.

10 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: The Commissioner is going to clarify what  
11 our decision is, at this point.

12 COMMISSIONER KEY: I think the option is to either take no  
13 action, or if we have a motion to rescind the previous decision  
14 to review Imboden Area Charter School, and the decision of the  
15 Charter Authorizing Panel on Imboden Area Charter School. So,  
16 no action is an appropriate action, in this case.

17 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: What is the pleasure of the Board?

18 (NO RESPONSE FROM BOARD MEMBERS.)

19 COMMISSIONER KEY: No motion.

20 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: No motion? Then we will leave that as it  
21 is. Now, the next question is whether or not there will be  
22 public comment allowed. Again, we need a motion, and second,  
23 and majority vote, of the Board to do that. So, what is the  
24 pleasure of the Board regarding -- we have seven people signed  
25 up for public comment. That opportunity, I think, will still

1 be available on the 31st, and that is just my input on that  
2 matter, but still, the Board has an opportunity to vote to  
3 determine whether or not we'll use this meeting also to hear  
4 public comments. So, what is the pleasure of the Board.

5 MS. SAVIERS: Ms. Newton, I have a question of  
6 clarification please. This is Vicki. I thought I heard Kendra  
7 say -- I'm having a real difficult time hearing from the  
8 podium. But, I thought I heard her say, or maybe I did not,  
9 that public comment was to be focused on the question at hand,  
10 which are the actions taken today, which is the gathering of  
11 additional information; is that correct?

12 MS. CLAY: It does not have to be. You, as a Board, can  
13 allow public comments. You often see that three minutes at the  
14 end of a meeting. I didn't mean to limit it that way. I would  
15 -- also I forgot to tell you at the beginning, there was some  
16 discussion about making sure that -- there was some discussion  
17 at the March 10th meeting, about making sure that the public  
18 had access to submit comments, and the Department, the charter  
19 school office, has created an online form that we will also  
20 make available for those March 31st comments, that the public  
21 can submit written comments as well as coming to that meeting  
22 on that date.

23 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Any other questions?

24 DR. BARTH: Kendra, on that -- we're receiving tons of  
25 emails. I think we've gotten several in this meeting already,

1 on this topic. Is there a way that we can coral those emails,  
2 as they come in? And I think we're very conscious about our  
3 need to retain certain records, but it's also -- I think it  
4 would be easier if we could find a way to just kind of house  
5 those. Whether it was an email address to which we could  
6 forward them to be sure that they were collected. I'm just  
7 trying to think of ideas that might be easy to be sure that  
8 everyone gets the information, but also, you know, make a  
9 little bit easier on us to actually be able to work with these  
10 -- a large number of emails.

11 MS. CLAY: Dr. Barth, I don't know how to address the issue  
12 of the large number of emails, at this time, other than the  
13 Department doing its best to get out that there is this Google  
14 form available and that would be the most stream lined and most  
15 wide-reaching way to submit public comment.

16 DR. BARTH: Okay. Do you think that we can post something  
17 to that effect on the -- on a couple spots on the website,  
18 maybe?

19 MS. CLAY: We will post it on the website. We can do a  
20 Commissioner's memo. We can push it, via social media. So,  
21 yes, we can do some things on our end to make sure the public  
22 is aware.

23 DR. BARTH: Okay. Thank you very much.

24 MS. REITH: Madame Chair, this is Mireya. I just wanted to  
25 -- in regards to the question about the public comments for

1 today. I know that the questions were directed to Ms. Clay.  
2 Is there any way to discern, or to ask the individuals if any  
3 of them are not available on the 31st? That would be the main  
4 reason that I could see wanting to make a motion for hearing -  
5 and any individual that may have a conflict, or unavailability  
6 on the 31st.

7 MS. CLAY: I can ask. Well, we have some people in  
8 overflow, so I can ask if anyone who signed up for public  
9 comment today will not be available to make public comment, on  
10 March 31st, or does not want to submit written comments via the  
11 Google form, if they can -- if they're in the room here, just  
12 stand up. If they're down in overflow, if they can come into  
13 the main auditorium, we can do our best to get a gauge on that.

14 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: We can do our best, but we may not be  
15 able to accommodate that, since this meeting and the March 31st  
16 meetings are two separate meetings in part. We're trying to  
17 reconnect with Ms. Saviers. She sent message that she is not  
18 online. So, we're at the question of whether or not -- we have  
19 seven people assigned for public comment and we have a question  
20 to the Board as to whether or not -- I'll guess we'll give a  
21 couple of minutes for Ms. Saviers. Is she on yet?

22 Well, we have a quorum. The question to the members of  
23 the Board is whether or not it's the desire of the Board to  
24 hear public comment.

25 MS. CLAY: Ms. Newton, if I may.

1 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Go ahead.

2 MS. CLAY: I'm told that all of the individuals who signed  
3 up today can make comment on the 31st.

4 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: Okay. Back to the Board members, what is  
5 your pleasure? Or having no response would indicate -- one  
6 more time. What is the pleasure of the Board, relative to  
7 public comments for today?

8 MS. CHAMBERS: This is Susan Chambers. I just had a  
9 question. Is there any chance that we would have sufficient  
10 desire of public comment, when we have our meeting in a week or  
11 so, to the extent that it was more people than we actually had  
12 time? Or, is the way to -- for anybody that signs up will be  
13 heard when we have that meeting?

14 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: What we are considering, because we don't  
15 have any way of knowing how many folks will sign up. Certainly  
16 time is a consideration. We had given some thought to having  
17 categories of responses, and you know, that's something that  
18 we'll still think about. But, certainly we'll get to the point  
19 that we will have to end the discussion, more than likely,  
20 before all comments are heard.

21 So, one of the things that I spoke to the Commissioner  
22 about, was maybe having a sign-in sheet that would designate a  
23 category, whether it be parent, student, community leader, or  
24 concerned citizen, so that we might go across the gamut and  
25 have equal representation, but at the same time, just

1 realistically knowing that we don't have the time to hear  
2 comments from, possibly, everyone that will show up to make  
3 comment. Giving preference, certainly, to school officials and  
4 administrators, of course, will have their period of comment  
5 allowed. And taking into account any legislators that may show  
6 up. We certainly would not ignore the legislative body, but  
7 outside of that, we will have to have some limitations about  
8 comments. Does that answer your question, Ms. Chambers?

9 MS. CHAMBERS: It does thank you.

10 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: All right. Hearing no motion from the  
11 Board, then we assume that that item does not -- that there's  
12 desire to address it, and this adjourns our meeting -- or, this  
13 concludes our meeting. Meeting is adjourned.

14 (The meeting was adjourned at 5:01 p.m.)

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

